



Journalists Against Organised Corruption

2nd February 2026 15.40pm

To: Most Reverend Mark O'Toole - Archbishop of Cardiff and Menevia

From Andrew Sibley - Founder - JAOC Investigations unit

On Behalf of the Survivors of Caldey Island and in Relation to Ongoing Investigations into Further Allegations of Abuse and Unexplained Deaths Not Addressed in the December 2024 Review, Concerning Three Men Operating Under the Auspices of the Catholic Church and the Cistercian Monastic Order

Your Grace,

I write on behalf of survivors of Caldey Island and in connection with ongoing investigations into further allegations of abuse and unexplained deaths involving Brother Titus, Father Mansell, and Father Daniels. These matters were not examined in the December 2024 safeguarding review and remain unresolved, despite their seriousness and the continuing impact on survivors and the wider public.

Each of the individuals referenced operated under the auspices of the Catholic Church and the Cistercian monastic order during their time on Caldey Island. Their roles, responsibilities, and the institutional structures surrounding them fall squarely within the Church's moral and pastoral jurisdiction. Survivors therefore look to you, as Archbishop of Cardiff and Menevia, for leadership, transparency, and decisive safeguarding action.

In light of the gravity of these unresolved matters, and the absence of any independent, verifiable safeguarding framework on Caldey Island, we respectfully request that you:

1. *Formally withdraw the Church's blessing and public endorsement of Caldey Island*, pending a full, independent safeguarding audit that includes the cases omitted from the 2024 review.
2. *Clarify what due-diligence processes were undertaken* before continuing ecclesiastical endorsement of the island in recent years.



3. Confirm the Church's current understanding of governance and accountability structures operating on Caldey Island, particularly in relation to safeguarding oversight.

Survivors have expressed deep concern that the Church's ongoing blessing creates an impression of institutional confidence that is neither justified nor safe. Symbolic actions carry weight, especially in cases involving institutional abuse. Withdrawing the blessing would demonstrate a clear commitment to transparency, safeguarding, and survivor-centred leadership.

We note that governance and trustee-oversight issues—including potential conflicts of interest—remain unresolved. These matters will be addressed separately with the appropriate regulatory bodies, but they form part of the wider context in which survivors seek accountability.

In light of the public-interest nature of this correspondence, we intend to publish both this letter and your response. Both JAOC investigations and survivors have repeatedly sought answers from Church authorities and have been met with silence or non-responses. This continued lack of engagement exacerbates their distress and reinforces the perception that their experiences are being minimised or disregarded.

Given the seriousness of the matters raised, and the need to prevent further harm to survivors, we respectfully request a clear and substantive response **within 14 days** of receipt of this letter. We also ask that your office provide a brief acknowledgement of receipt so that survivors can be assured that their concerns have finally been heard.

Yours sincerely,

Andrew Sibley JAOC Investigations

Independent Public-Interest Research & Reporting

cc: Senior Members of the Catholic Church (for transparency and oversight)

- **His Excellency Archbishop Miguel Maury Buendía** Apostolic Nuncio to Great Britain
- **His Eminence Cardinal Vincent Nichols** Archbishop of Westminster



- **Bishop Paul Mason** Lead Bishop for Safeguarding, Catholic Bishops' Conference of England & Wales
- **Dr. Nazir Afzal OBE** Chair, Catholic Safeguarding Standards Agency
- **Sir David Behan CBE** Chief Executive, Catholic Safeguarding Standards Agency
- **Abbot General, Cistercian Order (OCSO)**
- **Regional Abbot Visitor, Cistercian Order**